

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

Score row	Score points: Total = 13 (out of 30 possible points)	Scoring Commentary
Understanding and Analyzing Content	2: The report poses a problem, question or issue simplistically, places the problem in a limited context and provides no rationale, or a weak rationale, for the inquiry process.	The report attempts to consider a complex issue, cultural migration, but does so simplistically and places it in a broad historical context, "vikings ... Germans." There is no attempt to justify the inquiry process.
Understanding and Analyzing Perspective	4: The report identifies relevant perspectives, provides limited evaluation of the validity of arguments and reflects a limited understanding of how the reasoning is logically aligned with the conclusions of those arguments.	The report suggests cultural migration will be viewed through local and global perspectives. The report is organized around articles and within each section, the perspectives of each article is mentioned. The approach to evaluating the arguments of each article was formulaic but did allow for evaluation of the validity and the conclusions. "The conclusion is not reliable due to the lack of factual information and it being constructed mainly by opinion. It was greatly biased towards the cause of the overpopulation and providing information regarding that side of the argument." Other articles have more simplistic evaluations: "The conclusion was reliable because it stated some important points that wasn't included in the article."
Selecting and Using Evidence	2: The report cites limited evidence to build its argument.	The report cites evidence relative to its topic, but synthesis does not occur because each article is dealt with discretely rather than in support of an argument.
Building and Communicating an Argument	2: The report offers opinions or unclear resolutions, solutions, or conclusions not supported by evidence.	The conclusion is offered in the introduction: "...we are not actually the victims of cultural migration but due to conflicts within the country it's easily understandable as to why others would think otherwise"- and reiterated in the final paragraph. However, the final conclusion seems to look at immigration's effects in the past rather than considering ongoing issues discussed in the articles.
Selecting and Using Evidence	1: The report includes many errors in attribution and citation. The bibliography, if included, does not utilize a consistent style and format.	Errors in attribution and lack of attribution throughout the report. The entire "Immigration is not the problem" and "3 Ways Immigration Reform" sections lack attribution for quotes and paraphrasing, and no citation is included on the reference page. The bibliography includes a citation for "Redirect page."
Grammar and Style	2: The report contains some flaws in grammar and style that minimally interfere with communication to the reader.	"Proper nouns "vikings"; Possessives "Indias"; Word choice "These researches are"; "both in the internally and globally;" "un-considerably"; "advancing-sense"; Indecipherable text: "England." The British dream, David Goodhart takes the mosque as symbolic."

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

Ups and Downs of Cultural Migration

For centuries, the world has been constantly influenced by cultural migration from various amounts of civilizations. From the vikings coming and invading English lands to the Germans migrating over to America for work; we have faced both positive and negatives from the effects of cultural migration, which has led to us to developing the ideas that we have on cultural migration today. Cultural migration is a way of living that sparks a change in others spiritually and physically that spreads from the person to person as they meet others of differing cultures. As a group, we looked at local issues dealing with cultural migration, along with looking at the subject from a global perspective. In the end, our group concluded that we are not actually the victims of cultural migration but due to conflicts within the country it's easily understandable as to why others would think otherwise.

Overpopulation in India

In "India's Growth Held Back by Overpopulation" the different perspectives represented in the article are economic and social. The key components of the argument are over population which both India and Brazil have which is slowing down their development, causing many to live in poverty and under hideous conditions. The implications of the arguments are the need to control India's growing population, before it gets too out of hand. Some ideas to help control the overpopulation were the proposal of a new method of birth control. There is a valid conclusion due to the detailed information presented when describing the problem of Indias overpopulation. Fred De Sam Lazaro, provided a variety of perspectives. Some of which were the amount of wealth world recognized events brought into overpopulated countries like Brazil and India. As well as the progressive growth of the population by the different factors, some of

Comment [Reader1]: Rubric Row 5: Errors in attribution and lack of attribution throughout the report.

Comment [Reader2]: Rubric Row 6: "Proper nouns "vikings"

Comment [Reader3]: Rubric Row 1: The report attempts to consider a complex issue, cultural migration, but does so simplistically and places it in a broad historical context, "vikings ... Germans." There is no attempt to justify the inquiry process.

Comment [Reader4]: Rubric Row 2: The report suggests cultural migration will be viewed through local and global perspectives. The report is organized around articles and within each section, the perspectives of each article is mentioned. The approach to evaluating the arguments of each article was formulaic but did allow for evaluation of the validity and the conclusions.

Comment [Reader5]: Rubric Row 4: The conclusion is offered in the introduction: "...we are not actually the victims of cultural migration but due to conflicts within the country it's easily understandable as to why others would think otherwise"- and reiterated in the final paragraph.

Comment [Reader6]: Rubric Row 3: The report cites evidence relative to its topic, but synthesis does not occur because each article is dealt with discretely rather than in support of an argument. There are examples of this throughout the paper.

Comment [Reader7]: Rubric Row 6: Possessives "Indias"

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

which are the uncontrolled fertility rates. The sources used as supporting evidence were India's fertility rate and its census detailing its population growth. Both the fertility rates and the census are reliable sources which state factual information regarding the situation, giving a clear idea of the amount of people living in India. The context of the argument is the effects overpopulation has on the inhabitants of India. The conclusion is not reliable due to the lack of factual information and it being constructed mainly by opinion. It was greatly biased towards the cause of the overpopulation and providing information regarding that side of the argument.

Immigration/Migration Being a Concern

In "Overpopulation: Illegal immigration is about more than ethnic identity" the different perspectives presented were political and social. A key component of the claim would be the urgent need to control the large amount of legal and illegal immigrants coming to the United States. A major implication of the argument is to minimize the number of immigrants entering the country to prevent any further overpopulation. It was commented on the fact that immigration legal, illegal and the children born to immigrants make up eighty percent of U.S population growth. There is not a valid conclusion, because the article provides only one point of view throughout the entire article; and that was the negative effect immigration has on the country. Joseph Cotto included numerous points of views ranging from the census to urban designers. He did this to emphasize on the negative affect overpopulation is having on the city. The sources used as supporting evidence were, population percentages, use of certain resources and the rates of unemployment. The sources are reliable as a result of their factual information provided by all of them. The context of the argument are the vital actions necessary in order to control the U.S's rapid growing population rate. The conclusion is not reliable at all. It provides

Comment [Reader8]: Rubric Row 2: The approach to evaluating the arguments of each article was formulaic but did allow for evaluation of the validity and the conclusions. "The conclusion is not reliable due to the lack of factual information and it being constructed mainly by opinion. It was greatly biased towards the cause of the overpopulation and providing information regarding that side of the argument."

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

a single viewpoint regarding the issue of overpopulation, targeting immigration as the main factor, and not providing opposing viewpoint.

Mexican Immigrants in the United States

The perspectives I've discovered in "Mexican Immigrants in the United States" are political and cultural. The political perspective comes from where the article discusses the congresses and presidents role in the topic of illegal/legal immigration to the United States. The cultural perspective comes from the article discussing the cultural influence of other countries being implemented into the US. Some key components that could be found in this article are a lot of the US immigration statistics it contained and how immigration can make a country diverse versus the cons of immigration like "job-stealing" or overpopulation. This article implied that (legal) immigration itself shouldn't be an American problem considering all the other issues this country has to deal with. The article also implied that the US is a country of diversity and freedom and Americans should be more accepting with people moving to the US. The conclusion in this article is valid because it thoroughly restated its position on cultural influence in the US. (Malik King) Reconstruction on the article "Mexican Immigrants in the United States" The cultural perspective comes from evidence from the article discussing the huge increase in cultural migration to the US. The article talks about how cultural migration has contributed to the richness and diversity of the United States because people carry their knowledge and cultural expressions with them. The political perspective comes from evidence of the president getting involved with the issue of legal/illegal immigration. I'll state that the sources used in the are credible because it related this topic to presidential bills on immigration

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

being passed and the US conducted Census. The context of this article seemed to focus more on governmental\public reaction on the topic of immigration in the US. The context also included facts and reports from presidential statements towards immigration. Overall the article “Mexican Immigrants in the United States” does have a reliable conclusion because it thoroughly revealed key points on Mexican-American immigration that backed up what the article was discussing.

Does Immigration Actually Threaten American Culture

The perspectives that have been revealed in the article “Does Immigration Actually Threaten American Culture” are political and cultural. The political aspect comes from how the article implements some of the inactions of President Obama on him not pushing immigration reform. The cultural perspective comes from where the article discusses how immigration could have a probable effect on American culture. One key component discovered in this article is this very compelling statement: “if we let in too many foreigners, they and their children's beliefs will overwhelm our culture”. Another key component found was how the article was somewhat discussing how Americans don't really have a stable culture. This article implied that foreign cultures in the US will sooner or later consume our normal cultural beliefs. The conclusion in the article “Does Immigration Actually Threaten American Culture” is valid because it made compelling concluding points and it well contributed to the topic of the rest of the article.

Does Immigration Actually Threaten American Culture

The cultural evidence in the article “Does Immigration Actually Threaten American Culture” comes from the article stating “Accordingly, our culture rests on the ideas we adopt, as these determined the other values, skills and customs we uphold.”. This statement to me means

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

that we depend on other customs and traditions to help spice ours up. The political evidence comes from another section of the article discussing immigration reform and Obama's moral view on the topic of immigration. The sources used in the article are credible because most of the information in the article is based off of government facts and thorough research on the generic American lifestyle and culture. The context of the article was mainly about how dull American lifestyle has become over the years and through immigration it can be easily consumed by other cultures. The conclusion was reliable because it stated some important points that wasn't included in the article.

Immigration is not the problem

The Merton mosque believe that there has been cultural loss, but Goodhart thinks that they have been a disruption in the communities, a fraying of belongingness, and an unacceptable change. A key component will be that a fellow, Goodhart, is not a fan of immigration and wants to destroy it and keep it away from England. The British dream, David Goodhart takes the mosque as symbolic of the unacceptable change that immigration has wrought upon the nation. The mosque, he writes, 'replaced an Express Dairies bottling plant which provided a few hundred jobs for local people and lots of milk bottles- an icon of an earlier, more genesided age.' Mr. Goodhart believes that immigration will only bring nothing but problems. These problems would be poverty, loss of jobs for the citizens, and bring business down. Partially is true because immigrants go live to a new place for a brighter future for themselves and their loved ones. Of course they are going to take any chance to achieve and strive where there is offered opportunities. They'll be blind if they do not, they'll never be a change. For Goodhart, 'large-scale immigration' has created 'an England that is increasingly full of mysterious and

Comment [Reader9]: Rubric Row 2: The approach to evaluating the arguments of each article was formulaic but did allow for evaluation of the validity and the conclusions. Other articles have more simplistic evaluations: "The conclusion was reliable because it stated some important points that wasn't included in the article."

Comment [Reader10]: Rubric Row 5: "Immigration is not the problem" and "3 Ways Immigration Reform" sections lack attribution for quotes and paraphrasing, and no citation is included on the reference page.

Comment [Reader11]: Rubric Row 6: The British dream, David Goodhart takes the mosque as symbolic."

Comment [Reader12]: Rubric Row 6: Indecipherable text: "England."

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

unfamiliar worlds.'He quotes one man from Merton,'We've lost this place to other cultures.It's not English any more.'" Here he is implying that they are not welcomed here and wants to find a solution. But he is not the only one that thinks so,Robert Putnam thinks alike. Putnam has shown that communities that are more diverse tend to be less socially engaged by voting less,less community work,give less to charity,have fewer friends.People show distrust in other ethnic groups,including their own in diverse communities.There is not a valid conclusion here because the future can not be promised or seen in the present. Professors of Universities like Paul Collier, says that to unpack the impact of immigration on both the community and the people left behind the countries of origin. Too much immigration adversely affects both groups. It drains poor countries of human resources and undermines the social stability of the rich countries. This is a perspective that supports this argument. Sociologist have proven this in the research they have done in multiple communities. These researches are credible.

Comment [Reader13]: Rubric Row 6: Word choice "These researches are"

3 Ways Immigration Reform Will Lead to a Stronger American Economy

Some different perspectives are President Barack Obama and all people and organizations that are connected to immigration.The biggest dissatisfaction of the country is the economy. A big concern the citizens have is whether or not an immigration reform will impact the economy.And it will by consumption,tax revenue,and job creation,this is what they are trying to imply to everyone to better the economy.The conclusion is that immigration policy should be seen as an economy policy because that is exactly what this is, a chance to better our economy for all.There are statistics and projects that has proven a gradual difference the economy will be if we allow the immigration reform to be a bonus for an economy policy. Monthly payment formation indicates that immigrant wh small businesses and in college

Comment [Reader14]: Rubric Row 5: "Immigration is not the problem" and "3 Ways Immigration Reform" sections lack attribution for quotes and paraphrasing, and no citation is included on the reference page.

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

graduates are higher percentage than U.S. born citizens.

Immigration Laws in America

In December, Stephen Dinan wrote his article titled, “Immigrant rights activists block entry to ICE office, demand legalization”. The major perspectives that are represented in this article are politics, which is shown by the belief that Obama has the right to control immigration laws, along with economics, which is displayed by the protestors fighting against immigration laws, with most of them being Hispanic. The components of this article have to do with immigrants fighting for productive immigration laws that would be much similar to those that were allowed during the Dream Act legislation, with the protesters arguing that current immigration laws are counter-productive. However, as shown by the implications of this article, it is shown that Obama may not necessarily be capable of changing immigration laws all on his own. The article did have a valid conclusion, due to the article finishing off with the hopes that deportations will mainly be given to those with serious criminal records.

Evidence supporting perspectives in Stephen Dinan’s article, titled “Immigrant rights activists block entry to ICE office, demand legalization”, was given towards politics by giving examples of Obama’s power over immigration laws, along with economics by protestors fighting against current immigration laws, whom are mostly Hispanic. The sources used were Immigration Right Activists, with all of them seeking human rights, but none of them having known occupations, thus only making them partially credible; this also means that the article could be biased. The context of the arguments include how protestors are angered by current immigration laws and are demanding change, along with details on how the ICE is only trying to deport illegal immigrants who have severe criminal records. The conclusion of the article is

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

neutrally reliable because, although it does give a very valid ending for this article, it gives a lot of bias against immigration law makers.

Immigration Policies in the United Kingdom

In relation to the Stephen Dinan's article, Patrick Wintour wrote an article in January titled "Ukip wants a five-year ban on new migrants, says Nigel Farage". The major perspectives that are represented in this article are politics, which is shown by the United Kingdom Independence Party's leader, Nigel Farage, making decisions on the United Kingdom's immigration policies, along with economics, which is displayed by the almost two million of the migrants in the United Kingdom are illegal. The components of this article have to do with the introducing of new immigration policies, along with the ban of migrants to enter the United Kingdom for five years, and the constant mentioning of how many of those whom live in the United Kingdom are illegal migrants. This ties in with the implications of the article, which singles out the fact that current immigration policies within the United Kingdom are not very useful of helping keep watch over current migrant within the country. This article did not have a valid conclusion, due to the article spontaneously switching it's main focus on to issues occurring within a different country, and never finalizing in what is going to be done about the current issue within the United Kingdom.

Evidence supporting the perspectives present in Patrick Wintour's article, "Ukip wants a five-year ban on new migrants, says Nigel Farage", was given towards politics when the changes that were being brought upon immigration policies by Nigel Farage were mentioned, along with evidence being given towards the perspective of economics by the mentioning of how the total number of illegal migrants present in the United Kingdom came close to a total of

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

two million people. The sources used in the article include Nigel Farage, who is the leader of the Ukip party, thus making him quite dependable; however, due to him being a part leader, his opinions can be extremely biased. The context of the arguments include how changes to immigration policies within the United Kingdom could affect almost two million of the United Kingdom's citizens, along with how there is now a ban on entering the United Kingdom too migrants for five years. The conclusion of this article is not very reliable, due to the article finishing off on a random note of another conflict that is separate from the topic that had been discussed throughout the entire article, along with the conclusion of the article showing bias.

Before conducting research, [names redacted] had believed that we were victims of cultural migration due to those of differing cultures coming into the United States and **un-**
considerably changing the already functioning cultures that we had, along with causing constant over-flows of populations inside of this country. However, [name redacted] thought otherwise of the situation, believing that our country had originally been created by those of differing cultures, thus she believed that, throughout the years, our country has been constantly influenced by those of other countries in mostly positive ways, helping the United States grow and become what it is today. Due to the research that was conducted that was conducted while researching this issue, we found that, although cultural migration has led to violent activities **occurring both in the internally and globally**, it has also helped influence us positively in an **advancing-sense**; the blending of newer cultures has shown us the beauty of differing characteristics that can be found in not-so-familiar lands, and has also contributed to technological and political achievements. An additional research which would improve widen our viewpoint on the subject would be an article which depicted the beneficial side of cultural migrations. During the time of research, we found that the main perspectives that had to do with

Comment [Reader15]: Rubric Row 6: "un-considerably"

Comment [Reader16]: Rubric Row 6: "both in the internally and globally"

Comment [Reader17]: Rubric Row 6: "advancing-sense"

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

the articles were political, economical, and cultural. This research had caused everyone in our group to come to the conclusion that we're not victims of cultural migration; rather, we live in a country that had been created by a blend of those of several different cultures, and we wouldn't be as advanced as we are in this current time if we weren't.

Comment [Reader18]: Rubric Row 4: The conclusion is offered in the introduction: "...we are not actually the victims of cultural migration but due to conflicts within the country it's easily understandable as to why others would think otherwise" - and reiterated in the final paragraph. However, the final conclusion seems to look at immigration's effects in the past rather than considering ongoing issues discussed in the articles.

Student Sample 4 With Commentary

Work Cited

Dinan, Stephen. "Immigrant Rights Activists Block Entry to ICE Office, Demand Legalization." *Washington Times*. The Washington Times, 16 Dec. 2013. Web. 16 Jan. 2014.

Flows, Capital. "Does Immigration Actually Threaten American Culture?" *Forbes*. Forbes Magazine, 12 Nov. 2012. Web. 08 Jan. 2014.

"India's Growth Held Back by Overpopulation." *PBS*. PBS, n.d. Web. 16 Jan. 2014.

"Migration Information Source - Mexican Immigrants in the United States." *The Migration Information Source*. Ed. Sierra Stoney. MPI, 6 Feb. 2013. Web. 05 Jan. 2014.

"Overpopulation: Illegal Immigration Is about More than Ethnic Identity." *Washington Times Communities*. N.p., n.d. Web. 16 Jan. 2014.

"Redirect Notice." *Redirect Notice*. N.p., n.d. Web. 16 Jan. 2014.

Wintour, Patrick. "Ukip Wants a Five-year Ban on New Migrants, Says Nigel Farage." *Theguardian.com*. Guardian News and Media, 08 Jan. 2014. Web. 16 Jan. 2014.

Comment [Reader19]: Rubric Row 5: The bibliography includes a citation for "Redirect page." No citations included for "Immigration is not the problem" and "3 Ways Immigration Reform" sections.